MEDIA ARCHAEOLOGY AS PRACTICE:
THE CASE OF BILL MORRISON’S DAWSON CITY: FROZEN TIME

DULCE DA ROCHA GONÇALVES

Utrecht University
dulcegoncalves@gmail.com

Abstract

Bill Morrison’s film Dawson City: Frozen Time (2016) is about a famous story among archivists: in 1978, 533 nitrate film reels, mostly from the 1910s, were discovered in what used to be a swimming pool in a remote city in Canada. Many of these films were thought to be completely lost, and the Dawson City Film Find remain the only surviving prints to date. This paper will expose Morrison’s work as media archaeology practice, connected to media archaeology’s main thematic thread histories of the present. Morrison explores the Dawson City story as motive for a reflection on historical and material time. Erkki Huhtamo’s topos approach will be used as the framework for the analysis of Morrison’s treatment of history; and Vivian Sobchack’s conditions for experiencing the past as “presence” will inform the analysis regarding the importance of the film materiality. Finally, Eelco Runia’s thoughts on metonymic and metaphorical devices will inform the connection between history and presence.

Keywords: film, history, materiality, presence, topos, numinous object, metonymy

I’d heard the Dawson story so often that it had come to seem apocryphal: who ever heard of a swimming pool in the Yukon anyway?

Bill Morrison (in MacDonald, 2016, p. 42)

Bill Morrison’s film Dawson City: Frozen Time (2016) is about a famous story among archivists: in 1978, 533 nitrate film reels, mostly from the 1910s, were discovered in what used to be a swimming pool in the remote area of Canada’s Yukon. Many of these films were thought to be completely lost, and the Dawson City Film Find collection remains the recipient of the only known surviving prints to date. The story of this archive, the Dawson City Film Find, is one of the themes of Morrison’s film. “I’ve always chosen topics where the footage would play a major role - where the story and the narrative of the film was derived from the footage I was finding” (Morrison in Gottlieb, 2018). Along with the unearthing of the film reels from permafrost, the film also excavates the connections between Dawson City, a remote place in the Yukon, with important events of the last century: from the history of cinema production and distribution to changes in labour laws and sport regulations.
along with the gold rush of the Klondike. While we might not be able to place Dawson City on a map, the famous trajectory of this once legendary destination is imprinted in our recollection. For example, Charlie Chaplin making his way to Dawson City through snow-covered mountains, the Chilkoot Trail, in the film The Gold Rush from 1925. Rejecting the disembodied voice of a narrator and opting for superimposed text and a strong emphasis on the musical soundtrack, Morrison uses digital copies of the nitrate material recovered in 1978 (Hollywood features, newreels, serials), photographic and textual documents (for example, newspaper articles and letters), excerpts of other films and short interviews filmed during production to explore "the story of the twentieth century and the forces that were at play in shaping the world we live in today" (Morrison in MacDonald, 2016, p.43).

Morrison’s work with the Dawson City Film Find archive started in the midst of an important technological step regarding the storage of this collection, which, ultimately, was paramount to the production of this film. While the original nitrate prints recovered from Dawson City were firstly preserved onto film through optical printing and contact printing to 35 mm safety stock in 1978 (an effort undertook by Library and Archives Canada and the Library of Congress), with the introduction of a new 4K film scanner the films were able to be filed which was later printed onto 35mm film (Morrison and Paul Gordon in TIFF Talks, 2017).

Film theorist Matthew Levine (2015) asserts that while historical concerns are at the core of Morrison’s films, the filmmaker also aims to create “visceral sensations” with the exploration, for example, of the effects of time on the material object of the film strip, in a parallel visual study: the film reel is then seen as a document of the past in terms of content, but also as a “material entity” (p. 9). In this article I will argue that Morrison explores the Dawson City story as a motive to facilitate an encounter between history and presence, and, as such, Dawson City: Frozen Time can be considered as an example of media archaeology in practice. While this object is, in fact, a film, a narrative, a representation, it will be argued that Dawson City: Frozen Time is, at the same time, an object which delivers a re-presentation of the past, to use Vivian Sobchack’s expression, and is intrinsically connected to media archaeology’s key theme of histories of the present.

Histories of the present and Huthamo’s topos approach

Media archaeologist Jussi Parikka (2012, p.2) stresses that “thinking the new and the old in parallel lines” is the fundamental principle of media archaeology, and that its theoretical and academic field has always been juxtaposed with an experiment-based artistic practice, since media archaeology’s emergence in the 1980s and 1990s. Media archaeology’s thematic thread histories of the present are concerned with the idea that “newness”, what is considered to be new, is relative according to Parikka, it stems directly from Foucault’s idea that “archaeology is always about the present” (p.10). Media archaeology shares some principles with the New Historicism project, such as its cross-disciplinary approach and the conscious historical position of the observer, anchored in his or her own discourse, but looking into the past, while at the same time trying to understand the perspectives of that same preceding moment in time (Huthamo and Parikka, 2011). More importantly, New Historicism begins with the premise that there is no single universal history but rather many histories (Baron, 2014, p. 3).

Within the key theme histories of the present, media archaeologist Erkki Huthamo (2011) developed the topos approach as a way of identifying recurring topoi (topics) in media culture. Huthamo writes that “identifying topoi, analyzing their trajectories and transformations, and explaining the cultural logics that condition their ‘wanderings’ across time and space is one possible goal for media archaeology” (2011, p.28). Topoi can be understood as “commonplaces”, “recurring, cyclical phenomena and discourses” (Parikka, 2012, p. 11). Huthamo’s topos approach (2011) is a reformulation of Ernst Robert Curtius’ academic methodology which focused on literary topoi. However, Huthamo combines his method from the 1930s with Curtius’ contemporary art historical scholar Aby Warburg, who proposed the study of the visual culture of history. Warburg’s own Mnemosyne Atlas is in itself a product and an example of a visual methodology designated as Bildwissenschaft: a science of images, pictures, figures and illustrations (“images in the broadest sense”, “fine arts and high arts”) as the German materialist historian of the present are concerned with the idea that “newness”, what is considered to be new, is relative according to Parikka, it stems directly from Foucault’s idea that “archaeology is always about the present” (p.10). Media archaeology shares some principles with the New Historicism project, such as its cross-disciplinary approach and the conscious historical position of the observer, anchored in his or her own discourse, but looking into the past, while at the same time trying to understand the perspectives of that same preceding moment in time (Huthamo and Parikka, 2011). More importantly, New Historicism begins with the premise that there is no single universal history but rather many histories (Baron, 2014, p. 3).

Within the key theme histories of the present, media archaeologist Jussi Parikka (2012, p.2) stresses that “thinking the new and the old in parallel lines” is the fundamental principle of media archaeology, and that its theoretical and academic field has always been juxtaposed with an experiment-based artistic practice, since media archaeology’s emergence in the 1980s and 1990s. Media archaeology’s thematic thread histories of the present are concerned with the idea that “newness”, what is considered to be new, is relative according to Parikka, it stems directly from Foucault’s idea that “archaeology is always about the present” (p.10). Media archaeology shares some principles with the New Historicism project, such as its cross-disciplinary approach and the conscious historical position of the observer, anchored in his or her own discourse, but looking into the past, while at the same time trying to understand the perspectives of that same preceding moment in time (Huthamo and Parikka, 2011). More importantly, New Historicism begins with the premise that there is no single universal history but rather many histories (Baron, 2014, p. 3).

Huthamo’s topos approach resonates strongly with Morrison’s working methodology: the recursive and cyclical structure of Dawson City: Frozen Time is a direct consequence of Morrison’s research and montage strategy. In a first instance, Morrison’s research strategy can be seen as a verbatim search for topoi, either visual or descriptive, depending on the attention of the archivist to the creation of metadata associated with concrete visual content or general topics. “If I went through a database of the collection and selected films that included keywords in their description that were also in my narrative, the occurrences of the word ‘gold’ or ‘swimming pool’ or ‘film’, for example” (Morrison, 2017). Secondly, Morrison bases the film’s narrative upon the cyclical nature of events that are presented, namely the construction, destruction and reconstruction of Dawson City, the discovery, loss and recovery of the film reels or even humanity’s search for treasure in the form of digging for gold, digging for films (silver) and Morrison’s own mining of the archive. But the montage strategy of Dawson

1) One example of such recurring discourse is the discourse of immersive environments, which we connect today with virtual reality, but which could also be connected to the eighteenth century phantasmagoria. See, for example, Elliott, 2016.
2) Scott MacDonald uses the terminology “mining the archive” to refer to Morrison’s work. See MacDonald, 2016.
City: Frozen Time is also recursive. Morrison creates thematic clusters that organize a certain idea, that present a certain content, but at the same time, the content falls back into itself, into the visual material. A good example of this is the sequence dedicated to the cinema venues in Dawson City. The sequence introduces the growing number of venues and, in particular, the D.A.A.A Family Theater, using, in a first instance, newspaper articles and photographs with superimposed text. After this introduction, Morrison presents several excerpts from the Dawson City Film Find which show audiences entering venues, taking seats and facing a (possible) screen, stage or podium. While the footage is here working towards the illustration of an idea - the people living in Dawson went to the cinema at the D.A.A.A Family Theater - or, in other words, the documentation of their path – they were lost, discarded, buried, a place, a film that tells a story, present physical marks of that story that have been preserved. The purpose of these fragments from the film is to give the spectator the feeling of being inside that world, discovering what the film is about, understanding its context, and being immersed in its environment.

As mentioned before, Morrison uses different footage formats such as excerpts of fiction films and newsreels from the Dawson City Film Find, but also from other films, home movies, newspaper articles and documentary photographs in other words, archival documentation. As such, Dawson City: Frozen Time can be considered a compilation film. "Old (documentary) footage, already associated with reality in one way, becomes associated with reality in a new way, thus making new meanings and insights possible as well as giving rise to new tonalities and emotional states" (Nichols, 2014, p.149).

Moreover, Morrison also makes use of fiction-film footage and it is relevant to elaborate on the use of fiction-film material in the creation of a film that is so closely connected to history as Dawson City: Frozen Time. According to Jay Leyda (in Nichols, 2014), it is a compilation film, fiction films should not be treated as non-fiction documents (in the historical sense of the term). While in Dawson City: Frozen Time, fiction-film footage is used, it is still possible to claim that these particular fiction-film reels function as documents in this context. In the first instance, some of the fiction films depicted are inspired by the historical moments of the gold rush of the Klondike. For example, when Morrison creates a sequence between Chaplin's film The Gold Rush, interspersed with the Eric A. Hegg's documentary photographs of the Klondike Trail, their similarities in terms of framing and composition become obvious - to the point of questioning if Chaplin had seen Hegg's photographs in advance. Therefore, the status of the Chaplin's The Gold Rush as a fiction film becomes challenged in this regard. Secondly, the fiction-film reels in themselves provide material documentation of their path – they were lost, discarded, buried, discovered and recovered and present physical marks of that journey: "the footage that I’m finding is documentary - they are pieces of physical history that can be handled" (Morrison in Gottlieb, 2018).

It is interesting to understand Leyda's alignment with media archaeology's theme of histories of the present: "for Leyda, the compilation film was a way to understand history in a new way, not a technique for the perpetuation of more of the same" (Nichols, 2014, pp.150-151). Regarding this goal of understanding history, and the treatment of archival documentation in a new way, it is interesting to discuss Jamie Baron's temporal and intentional disparity relating to compilation film. As such, film, photographs, text documents or digital material (Baron, 2014, p.9). Baron defines temporal disparity as "the perception of an appropriation film of a ‘then’ and a ‘now’ within a single text" (p.18). The introductory prologue of Dawson City: Frozen Time is a good example of temporal disparity, the first seconds of the film present footage from the Haarlem World Series of 1917 and 1919 – recovered in Dawson City – with a contemporary commentary by Chris Russo. The viewer understands quickly that Bill Morrison is a guest in a contemporary sports show in which the footage is being discussed. However, the next shots present footage from the 1950s and 1970s and even an interview with Kathy Jones and Michael Gates (who found the footage in 1978) filmed by Morrison during the research stage of the film. Every film excerpt is given a small caption regarding the title and date of the film, with the exception of the interview (the only interview in the film, displayed in the beginning and at the end) and the footage from Chris Russo's show. These excerpts create a very clear now relating to the production stage, particularly the fact that the filmmaker himself can be seen talking about the film that one is about to see. All the other footage belongs to a then – a past that is reinforced by the dates on the screen. On the other hand, Baron's concept of intentional disparity has to do with the fact that when recontextualising a certain text, the text will always "carry traces of another intention with them and seem to resist, at least to some degree, the intentions that the appropriation filmmaker – by argument and design – imposes upon them" (p. 25). This issue is particularly important for this case, because while Baron maintains that intentional disparity creates resistance, in several sequences of Dawson City: Frozen Time, the intentional disparity actually reinforces the imposed idea. For example, and as mentioned previously, when Morrison uses film footage to convey the knowledge that the inhabitants of Dawson City went to the movies, the footage used to portray that event, is the actual film footage from the movies they saw – the images used by Morrison come from the reels projected in the cinema venues of Dawson City in the 1910s and 1920s.

In the opening of Dawson City: Frozen Time, we are reminded that “film was born of an explosive.” While Morrison is referring to the chemical components of nitrate films, we can also remember Walter Benjamin’s (2008 [1936]) echoes regarding montag: "then came film and exploded this prison-world with the dynamite of the split second” (p.37). This literal and figurative connection of the idea of explosion with Morrison’s montage of topical clusters is indeed revelatory of the thematic and structural organisation of the film. In fact, the drive towards explosion and ruins, clustering and shattering is, in this case, not only a formal editing device, but also an echo of the film’s narrative – the cyclical revolutions of discovery and loss, of destruction and renovation, of fires and floods. The last sequence of Dawson City: Frozen Time offers a pertinent

3) This quote is one of the superimposed texts throughout the film.
example of such strategy. The sequence presents a film reel with considerable water damage, not only limited to the margins of the image, but throughout the whole frame, resembling the motion of fire blazes. However, these apparent fire blazes are indeed created by water damage. Beneath the fire blazes’ water damage, the viewer can detect the swerving figure of a dancer, as well as one of the intertitles of the recovered reel: “The salamander of the ancients was a mythical creature that lived through fire unscorched”.

Film materiality and Sobchack’s (re)presenting of the past

Another media archaeological concern at the core of Morrison’s work is presence: this is achieved mainly through the focus on film’s materiality. For Morrison (2015), materiality is a central issue: “Exploring the tension between the surface and the image, or between the image and what it is that it carries, is what has always interested me in making films” (p. 17). Media theorist Vivian Sobchack (2011) uses the term (re)presenting of the past to explain media archaeology’s attention to presence. According to Sobchack, “much of media archaeology regards presence as a “transhistorical operative practice” – the transference or relay of metonymic and material fragm ents or traces of the past to the ‘here and now’”. Nevertheless, numerous objects are not necessarily art objects (and here the definition starts to disentangle itself from Benjamin’s aura), because their material and aesthetic qualities are not the (only) reason for their value. Instead, the value of numerous objects relies on their unseen qualities, their connection to a certain idea or certain moment in the past, which is embedded in a material container. One example of a numinous object is the original diary of Anne Frank which is on display at Anne Frank’s House Museum, in Amsterdam: the important quality of this object is not its aesthetic value, but its connection with a moment in the past, the World War II and the Holocaust, and very particularly, the physical connection of this object with the past.

It could be said that, as well as being a numinous object, the diary of Anne Frank is also a metonymy of World War II. Philosopher of history Erlo Ruina (2014) has written extensively about metonymy and its capacity for the “transfer of presence”. First of all, it is important to understand here the difference between metonymy and metaphor: while metaphor substitutes an object for another making use of an external connection, metaphors (and here the definition starts to disentangle itself from Benjamin’s aura), because their material and aesthetic qualities are not the (only) reason for their value. Instead, the value of numerous objects relies on their unseen qualities, their connection to a certain idea or certain moment in the past, which is embedded in a material container. One example of a numinous object is the original diary of Anne Frank which is on display at Anne Frank’s House Museum, in Amsterdam: the important quality of this object is not its aesthetic value, but its connection with a moment in the past, the World War II and the Holocaust, and very particularly, the physical connection of this object with the past.

For example, saying that reading the diary of Anne Frank is like looking through a window to occupied Amsterdam during World War II is a metaphor: it is connect ing the object (diary) to another object (window) by means of explaining the first object. On the other hand, the object itself, the diary, is a metonymy for that very particular period of time: the object itself summons the reality of the Jewish persecution during the war, it is a metonymy for that reality. Ruina states that all relics are metonymies and that the metonymy’s capacity for presence derives directly from this lack of explanatory dimension: because metonymy presents no meaning (meaning belongs to metaphor), it “insinuates that there is an urgent need for meaning” (p. 71), without, however, presenting an easy solution for that need.

In Morrison’s film, “presence” is achieved through the fact that the recovered film reels are, at this moment, originals. The mark of their originality is the recognisable “Dawson Flute”, the white streaks which can be observed in the margin of the frame, created by water damage: “this water damage is unique; you can always spot a Dawson film” (Morrison in MacDonald, 2016, p.41). Consequently, this damaged object is no longer a copy, a mechanically reproduced object, but it is, instead, a singular object. Scholar Bernd Herzogenrath (2018) names this process the “re-auration” of the film image, in the sense that the damaged image allows for “direct contact with time and space” (pp. 90-91) Herzogenrath coined the term “matter-image” in relation to Morrison’s film Decasia (2002): the matter-image is a “time-image not created by a human subject, but by time and matter itself” (p. 84). Following the same reasoning, scholar Hanjo Berressem (2018) discusses the concept of optical unconscious in connection with Morrison’s films. In Berressem’s argument, the optical unconscious does not concern what humans are unable to see without the aid of technology, but the “hidden” story of the material, which then overflows over the image content. As opposed to Walter Benjamin's concept of optical unconscious, Berressem shifts the focus from cultural registers to material and medial registers (p. 111). While Herzogenrath and Berressem are discussing nitrate decay, the natural process of nitrate film decomposition (by which the film strip returns to its nitro-cellulose, gelatin and silver emulsion components), which is a fundamental feature of several of Morrison’s films, in the case of Dawson City: Frozen Time the damage, as mentioned, mostly derives from the conditions of the discovery of the film reels: it is the direct “unfortunate aftermath of non-professionals handling the footage in August of 1978, after it had been kept at a certain temperature and humidity for fifty years” (Morrison in MacDonald, 2016, p. 41). As such, these conditions are not a natural phenomenon (such as the natural decomposition of nitrate), but are traces of the history of these
reels in particular, and not only a consequence of the passage of time. Therefore, the original quality of the Dawson City Film Find reels is created not only from the material inscription of time, but also from the material inscription of the historical moments which the reels were subjected to.

The film reels bear the traces of not only its own temporality, but of its own history. Morrison explores this material damage, this presence of time and history in the object, to the point of creating an actual engagement with the water damage, with the “Dawson Flutter”: Morrison creates an interaction between the figures on the screen and this material and singular decay. While, at first sight, this might seem like a coincidence, as the viewer might take some time to realise that level of interaction, the filmmaker is very transparent about his intentions: “I collected my favorite scenes where the characters in a scene seem to be reacting to this water damage” (Morrison, 2017).

As numerous objects, these film reels are also metonymies – an adjacent or partial object that refers to another object. In this case, this other object is the story of Dawson City. The film reels as such do not explain the thread of events that created them – an adjacent or partial object of the film reels. To connect them to the story of Dawson City, Morrison creates a metaphor: he is explaining the disposal of the film reels in the river by connecting it to another idea – the idea of throwing a treasure coffer overboard from a ship. But Morrison is creating a metaphor from a metonymic object – the image of the intertitle and the throwing of the chest exhibits the “Dawson Flutter” in its margins: in these physical markings, the object reveals itself adjacent and pertaining to the story of Dawson City; it brings with it the presence of the city, while at the same time, it also provides meaning. By highlighting the materiality of these particular film reels and in connection with this editing strategy, Morrison enables a contact between two temporal moments, enables the (re)-presenting of the past in the present, enables a moment of contact with history. Furthermore, by exploring the interaction between the metonymical water damage and the figure in the imprinted image of the same film reels, Morrison adds the integration of a third temporal moment, the temporality of the actor in that image. We could even argue that it also adds the production and the distribution temporality of that specific film reel. We can then say that Morrison creates a place of encounter through various temporalities, spiraling into the end of the nineteenth century and falling back on the viewer from the twenty-first century.

The artistic practice of Bill Morrison has been imparted with numerous designations. Director of UCLA film and television archive and scholar Jan-Christopher Horak (2018) proposes to regard the filmmaker as an archaeologist of cinema. Horak’s argument regards Morrison’s work Outerborough (2005), by analysing this film as revisiting early cinema and avant-garde concerns. In particular, Horak argues that Morrison’s device in Outerborough - a side-by-side, discontinuous speed, almost stereoscopic projection of the original film from 1899 New York to Brooklyn Across Brooklyn Bridge – aims to “theorize” the connection between early cinema avant-garde cinema. Some scholars have added the poetic dimension to Morrison’s filmmaking practice, “a poetic archaeology of cinema”, connected to Morrison’s explorations between archival film and experimental cinema (Levine, 2015). And some writers preferred to highlight Morrison’s emphasis on the materiality and decay of film, under the designation of archaeology of ruins (Zimmer, 2015). Still others prefer to highlight the documentary component, designating Morrison a “speculative documentarist” (Gottlieb, 2018). In this article I have argued that Bill Morrison is also a media archaeologist, using particular methodologies to create a dialogue between history and present, between past and present.

Morrison’s entry point towards history is the materiality of the film. This material component is the metonymic vessel which Morrison sequences in topical clusters, within a metaphorical, but at the same time, metonymic, frame. These topical clusters are a particular result from Morrison’s research framework, a verbatim topoi approach, within the database compiled from the archival material. Within its metaphorical frame, the narrative of the film, overarching topoi are also used, reinforcing the cyclical events. An example is the topic of mining for treasure, for gold, for silver (the film reels) and the own mining of the archive, in Morrison’s methodology. The topical metaphorical frame, the meaning creation device, is at times more explicitly explanatory than others: sometimes Morrison purely hints at meaning, but refrains from obvious clarifications. As such, an urge for meaning is underlined.

Ultimately, Morrison was only able to produce Dawson City: Frozen Time due to the oversight of a few individuals - one of those eccentric anecdotes treasured by the New Historians project. The Dawson City Film Find exists today because someone decided to use the film reels as filling in a construction site in which a swimming pool was transformed into a permanent ice hockey rink. All the other prints on this end of the distribution line were thrown into the Yukon river. By combining media archaeological concerns with the materiality of the support, Morrison’s film can be seen as a cautionary tale to our contemporary approach to media. Is our relationship with media today so different to the one portrayed in Dawson City: Frozen Time? Cinema scholar Nadia Bozak (2012) argues that the situation might be quite similar “for we rip and burn and download - and delete - with as much zeal as early cinema mongers tossed reels in the trash” (p. 205). It remains to be seen if our digital visual culture will still be available to access, and if so, in what kind of state of digital decay, in the twenty-second century. In what concerns Bill Morrison, a 35mm print of Dawson City: Frozen Time will be stored by MoMA in a climate-controlled archive. “So there is a good chance this film will outlive me, even if it may take somebody 100 years from now to dig it up again” (Morrison, 2017).
References


