

Teotónio R. de Souza

**D. JOSÉ DA COSTA NUNES –
A PATRIARCH WHO CARED FOR MORE THAN SOULS:
A CASE OF CAESARO-PAPISM IN PORTUGUESE INDIA, 1942-1953**

Stating the Problem

The Archipelago of Azores was a strategic point in the centre of the Atlantic Ocean, located at the cross-roads of the maritime trade routes of the East and West Indies. The Portuguese discovered and began colonizing it since mid 15th century. It became a strategic link for the Portuguese colonial network and functioning worldwide. On his return after the first voyage to India, Vasco da Gama stopped in Azores before touching Lisbon. That is where his brother Paulo died during the return voyage from India. The lack of sufficient resources in the islands and to some extent the regularity of earthquakes contributed for the emigration of its population on a large scale, initially to South of Brasil between 1748-1756, and later to Bermudas, Hawaii, USA, and more recently to Canada.

But what would take so many prominent churchmen from Azores to the East? A reasonable answer lies in the tendency of the islanders to migrate, combined with the fact that it was dominantly a white population of settlers of European descent, with no other language and culture than the Portuguese. These two factors explain why the Portuguese colonial interests preferred the Azorean clerics as a subaltern elite to occupy the high ecclesiastical positions in their *Padroado* of the East. Similarly, in the early 19th century, the Portuguese would opt to promote a second subaltern elite in Goa, to provide medical facilities required for overcoming the health hazards and to create the third Portuguese empire in Africa. Returning now to the first subaltern elite in service of the empire, the conflict of the Portuguese *Padroado* with St. Thomas Christians in the 16th century in South India was an indicator of the Portuguese utilization of Church Patronage for colonial domination.¹ Equally talented, or more talented Goan clerics were systematically bypassed, because they were "coloured" (there is vast archival documentation that could be cited from the times of St. Francis Xavier and European missionaries of more recent past calling them "niggers" and other pejorative adjectives²) and were unwilling to give up fully their native Indian culture and traditions. In the first half of the 17th century Propaganda Fide consecrated the first

- 1 Teotonio R. de Souza: The Indian Christians of St. Thomas and the Portuguese Padroado: Rape after a century-long courtship (1498-1599), in: Klaus Koschorke (ed.): *Christen und Gewürze*, Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 1997, pp. 31-42.
- 2 Teotonio R. de Souza: The Portuguese in the Goan Folklore, in: Charles J. Borges/Helmut Feldman (eds.): *Goa and Portugal: Their Cultural Links*, New Delhi: Concept Publ. Co., 1997, pp. 183-197.

native Goan bishop against violent reaction of the Portuguese Padroado. He was D. Matheus de Castro. He was prevented by the Portuguese of normal functioning and was forced to retire in Rome. There is another famous instance of Goan clerics leading a political revolt in 1787, known as the Conspiracy of Pintos. It ended in a ruthless suppression by the Portuguese authorities, which accused of "high treason" and deported to Portugal over a dozen clerics and kept them for several years under arrest without any official trial. In the late 19th century there was the case of Fr. Francisco Xavier Alvares, who denounced the abuses of the Portuguese church hierarchy and civil authorities by switching his allegiance to the Antiochian Church as Mar Julius I. His weekly publication *O Brado Indiano* had become an unbearable irritant to the Portuguese authorities in Goa. They punished and humiliated the priest publicly for that.³ These instances should suffice to justify the Portuguese colonial interest in ruling by proxy, preferring white Azorean prelates to metropolitan ones, to protect their imperial interests in the East. Only in the past century and half, five Azoreans from Pico island occupied the highest Church positions in Macau and in Portuguese India in a continuous succession. There were seven other Azorean bishops in the East originating from the other islands of that archipelago, though not all reached the East to take charge of their posting.

D. José da Costa Nunes spent nearly three decades in Macau before he became the Archbishop-Patriarch of Goa and Primate of the East Indies in 1942. He was very talented and combined with great zeal his interest for souls and for the Portuguese empire under threat in the decade which would see India independent and the rest of Asia in political ferment leading to the end of the European colonialism. This paper seeks to analyse some of his prolific writings in order to throw light upon some important political moves in which he was involved at national and international levels in defence of the Portuguese colonialism abroad and the Portuguese dictatorship of Oliveira Salazar at home. Always in God's name!

That is where the caesaro-papism comes in, if we can accept Weber's definition: "the complete subordination of priestly to secular power" (Weber 1968, 1161). We see this happening time and again, an reaching its maximum expression, under the "New State" regime of Salazar in Portugal since 1926 till 1974. There may have been regular Concordats signed, but in practice the Portuguese authorities tended to claim the right to subordinate the Church interests to their national-colonial interests. The Portuguese dictator would issue veiled and open threats, whenever the Vatican policy did not fall in line with his State policies.⁴ Just a brief survey of the Portuguese "Padroado" should help clarifying to some extent this point.

3 Teotonio R. de Souza: Christianization and cultural conflict in Goa: 16th-19th centuries, in: Congresso Internacional de História: Missionação Portuguesa e Encontro de Culturas, Braga, 1993, Actas IV, Missionação: Problemática Geral e Sociedade Contemporânea, pp. 383-393.

4 Manuel Braga da Cruz: O Estado Novo e a Igreja Católica, Lisboa: Editorial Bizâncio, 1998, passim.

Portuguese Padroado: An Instrument of Colonial Expansion and Commercial Monopoly

Here goes a brief survey of the *Padroado Português* or the Portuguese Crown Patronage, which had its beginning in the age of Discoveries in the XV century. In exchange of the recognition of the exclusive Portuguese right to discover, dominate and evangelize the countries and peoples of the East, the Papacy imposed upon the Portuguese crown the obligation of taking care of all the expenses connected with that process of evangelization, including the costs of building and maintaining human and material resources.⁵ The bull *Romani Pontifex* of Nicholas V on 8 January 1455 gave the Portuguese authorities of the Order of Christ the right to establish and maintain churches and monasteries and of presenting candidates to run them in the newly discovered and in territories yet to be discovered. On 13 March of the same year Pope Calixtus III issued the bull *Inter coetera* confirming the earlier privileges and obligations, conceding to Prince Henry as Master of the Order of Christ the spiritual jurisdiction which would be exercised through the Prior of Tomar. The bull *Praeclara charissimi* of Julius III allowed the incorporation of the three existing military Orders (Christ, Avis and Santiago) into the Portuguese Crown, and the jurisdiction of the Prior of Tomar was also transferred to the crown. That is how the "Padroado" grew into "Crown Patronage".⁶

From the first overseas diocese in Funchal (Madeira), the Portuguese Padroado went on expanding with new dioceses, starting in Goa (1537), in Malacca (1557), at Cochin (1558) and at Macau in 1575. More would follow in Japan and elsewhere. It was the right of the king of Portugal to choose the bishops for these dioceses. It was a way of safeguarding the Portuguese political and commercial monopoly against other European rivals, particularly the Castilians to start with. During the union of the Iberian crowns (1580-1640), the Portuguese privileges of Padroado were respected by the Philips of Spain.⁷ The following maps may help to situate the expansion of the Portuguese presence and to locate the various dioceses in Asia.⁸ The advantage for the Papacy in coming to such agreements with Portugal and Spain gave it an opportunity without any material costs for compensating the numbers of faithful that were being lost in Europe as a result of the Protestant Reformation. This system of mutual convenience fared sufficiently well while the Portuguese could enforce their maritime presence without much effective resistance. From the early 17th century the Dutch and the English also looked for a share in the Eastern trade. The European rivalry emboldened the native rulers to resist. The Portuguese military weakness and lack of human resources to

- 5 Charles-Martial de Witte: *Les lettres papales concernant l'expansion portugaise au XVI^e siècle*, Immensee: Nouvelle Revue de Science missionnaire, 1986.
- 6 Manuel Saturnino da Costa Gomes: *Nomeação de Párcos e Bispos – artigos IX, X*, in: *A Concordata de 1940 – Portugal – Santa Sé*, Lisboa: Edições Didaskalia, 1993, pp. 174-185.
- 7 *Ibid.*
- 8 Sanjay Subrahmanyam: *O Império Asiático Português, 1500-1700 – Uma História Política e Económica*, Lisboa: Difel, 1995, pp. 430-432.

fulfil the obligations of the *Padroado* led the Holy See to establish the Congregation of Propaganda Fide in 1622 to promote directly some missionary activities through its own "Apostolic Vicars" in territories where the Portuguese were unable to operate successfully. The expulsion of the Jesuits from Portugal in 1759 and the expulsion of all Religious Orders by liberal government in 1834 weakened the *Padroado* dramatically. There ensued a long diplomatic tension between Portugal and the Holy See, leaving vacant several dioceses during long periods. Despite the Portuguese official resentment Pope Gregory XVI issued the brief *Multa Praeclara* on 24 April 1838, delinking from the Portuguese *Padroado* jurisdiction several dioceses, such as Mylapore, Cranganore, Cochin and Malacca. Only in 1851 there was a thaw in the diplomatic relations between Portugal and the Holy See, and the Concordat of 1857 restored theoretically the jurisdiction of the *Padroado*, but with many practical restrictions. A new and more realistic drawing of the boundaries was worked out by the Concordat of 23 June 1886, the year of the creation of independent Indian church hierarchy. The Archbishop of Goa was granted the honorary title of Patriarch on this occasion as a political sop. Fresh problems arose with the proclamation of the Republic in Portugal in 1910. A law separating State and Church on 20 April 1911 sought to reduce the financial obligations of the State, but without abandoning the privileges of the *Padroado*. This situation changed under the *Estado Novo*, which by the Accord of 15 April 1928 revised the concordat of 1886, limiting the *Padroado* jurisdiction to territories under direct Portuguese political control and to Cochin and Mylapore, and maintaining a double jurisdiction over Bombay, Mangalore, Quilon and Trichinopoly. The conflicts that resulted from the double jurisdiction were solved by a new concordat of 7 May 1940. Following the independence of India, yet another accord was signed on 18 July 1950, whereby Portugal renounced to its *Padroado* rights in all territories of independent India. Following the integration of Goa, Daman and Diu into India in 1961 by force of arms, Portugal did not renounce its rights over these territories until after the democracy was restored in Portugal in April 1974.⁹

Enter the Azorean Prelates

The island of Pico is the second largest island of Azores, and at least five Azorean prelates in the East were born there. In chronological order, we have D. João Paulino de Azevedo e Castro, born in 1852 in the town of Lages in Pico.¹⁰ He studied Theology at Coimbra¹¹ (1879), was ordained in Angra, lectured at the Seminary

9 Eduardo Brazão: *Colecção de concordatas estabelecidas entre Portugal e a Santa Sé de 1238 a 1940*, Lisboa: Liv. Bertrand, 1941; A. Leite: *Concordatas*, in: *Dicionário da História Religiosa de Portugal*, Vol.I, ed. by Carlos Moreira Azevedo, Rio do Mouro: Circulo de Leitores, 2000, pp. 423-429.

10 João Paulino de Azevedo e Castro: *Provisões e Outros Escritos*, vol. II, Macau 1997, p. 749.

11 Ermelindo Ávila: *Picoenses - Emigrantes no Mundo*, in: *II Congresso de Comunidades Açorianas*, Açores 26-30 November 1986, Angra do Heroísmo, 1986, pp. 259 f.

there and became its Rector in 1888.¹² He was confirmed by Leo XIII on 9 June 1902 as bishop of Macau, was consecrated 27 December and left for Macau in March 1903. Following 1910 his governance of Macau was marked by political tensions caused by the republicanism in Portugal, affecting severely the functioning of the religious orders and congregations in Macau. He died in Macau in 1918, and his body was transferred in 1923 to his native land of Lages do Pico.

D. José da Costa Nunes, also from Pico, was born in the parish of Candelária on 15 March 1880.¹³ Studied at the Seminary of Angra¹⁴ and in 1903 accompanied the bishop D. João Paulino de Azevedo e Castro to Macau, as his personal secretary, while still a seminarian.¹⁵ He was ordained priest in Macau and celebrated his first Mass on 31 July 1903, feast day of Ignatius of Loyola, the founder of the Jesuits who left an indelible mark upon the missionary history of Macau. Before being confirmed as bishop of Macau, he was elected Vicar Capitular, with just 26 years of age and without having belonged to the Chapter.¹⁶ Two years after the death of D. João Paulino he was elected bishop of Macau. His election was confirmed by the Holy See, despite his refusal.¹⁷ Two other bishops from Pico in Azores, namely D. Paulo Tavares (till 1973) and D. Arquimínio Rodrigues da Costa (till 1988) succeeded him in Macau. In India, D. José Vieira Alvernaz, also from Pico in Azores, was appointed his Assistant in 1941, and in 1953, would succeed him as Archbishop-Patriarch. Most of these prelates and others from Azores earlier in the East had something in common: All had been connected with the Seminary at Angra and had studied at Gregorian in Rome. It had become a sort of a clan that promoted its interests and created a dynasty.

Costa Nunes showed his capacity to handle diplomatically and with courage several situations of political tension. Once, at the Military Academy, where republican and anti-clerical feelings were high, he was invited to speak. The President was not very confident of the consequences, but Costa Nunes gave his speech and was able to win the spirits. He even told to one high-ranking military: "I shall welcome the Revolution, but with all the marines on my side". Once some angry military personnel invaded his palace, but he withstood the threat and the invaders retreated. When his bishop returned to the diocese, he admired the courage and tact of his substitute. He gave him an opportunity in 1911 to visit Timor, Malacca and Singapore as Mission visitor, but in reality to rest after the strenuous times. He returned to Macau in 1912, and took once again charge of the diocese, while the bishop was visiting Singapore and Malacca. He spent 1912 resting at home in

12 Manuel Teixeira: *Macau e a sua Diocese – XVII Bispos, Missionários, Igrejas e Escolas no IV Centenário da Diocese de Macau*, Macau: Tipografia da Missão, 1976, pp. 80 f.

13 Ávila: *Picoenses – Emigrantes no Mundo*, p. 260.

14 José da Costa Nunes: *Textos do Cardeal Costa Nunes*, vol. IV, Macau: Fundação Macau, 1999, pp. 280-283.

15 João Paulino de Azevedo e Castro: *Provisões e Outros Escritos*, vol. II, Macau 1997, pp. 750-756.

16 José Augusto Pereira: *Memória Histórica de Açorianos que foram Bispos*, in: *I Congresso Açoriano* (Lisboa, 8-15 May 1938), Ponta Delgada: Grémio dos Açores, 1995, pp. 275-277.

17 Da Costa Nunes: *Textos do Cardeal Costa Nunes*, vol. IV, pp. 280-283.

Azores. Back in Macau in 1914, he started a diocesan review "Oriente" in 1915. Following the death of the bishop Paulino in 1918, he was elected by the diocesan Chapter to be Vicar Capitular. It was the first step, which lasted three years, before taking charge of the diocese of Macau as its bishop on 20 November 1921. He started by putting finances on a firm footing and finding ways of improving the human resources of the diocese. He revived the seminary and handed it to the Jesuits in 1930, but the lack of personnel forced them to keep only the responsibility of spiritual guidance. He called upon the Franciscan Missionaries of Mary to take charge of a school for girls, named after Santa Rosa de Lima. He gave further backing to the Salesians, who had been invited by his predecessor, to provide professional training to young Chinese and Portuguese in Macau. He gave support to Canossian sisters in their schools and in their apostolate for infants and the invalid. He gave immense impetus to missionary expansion. The Jesuits had their base at Shiu-Hing, where once Ricci had worked. Costa Nunes was particularly devoted to Timor, which belonged to Macau diocese and was divided into two vicariates. He joined the two into one vicariate for better coordination. Founded a school for catechists, got the old Salesian boys from Macau to teach in professional schools, and tried to prepare the ground to provide Timor with its own bishop. Built a cathedral which the Japanese razed to the ground. He succeeded in convincing the Holy See and the Portuguese government to let Timor have its diocese. It became a reality on 18 January 1941. His dedication to the missions of Malacca and Singapore was also noteworthy. He took the Canossians sisters and the Irish Christian Brothers to set up schools for Christian boys and girls. The diocese of Macau was the owner of a hotel in the centre of Singapore, but when the British administration took it over to convert it into a Court of Justice, the diocese invested the compensation money into buying two huge commercial buildings, which the Vicar General names as Medeiros Building and Nunes Building, despite the objection raised by Costa Nunes to his name being used that way.

D. José da Costa Nunes was 60 years and 9 months old when he was appointed to Goa on 11 December 1940. He took charge of the Archdiocese on 18 January 1942, on the eve of reaching 62 years of age. He was honoured by the Salazar regime with *Grã Cruz da Ordem do Império* in 1953. It was the highest class (among five) of that national award created in 1932 by the Salazar regime. He resigned in December that year from the Archdiocese of Goa and Damão and was nominated Titular Archbishop of Odessa. He was later given the job of Vice Camarlengo of the Vatican. In 1962 John XXIII made him Cardinal. He died in Rome on 26 November 1976 aged 94.¹⁸

Archbishop Costa Nunes was known to exercise himself physically every day with long walks, had given up smoking since 1925, and was frugal in his eating and regular with his night sleep. His intellectual capacities and talent for writing

¹⁸ Cardeal Costa Nunes - in *Memoriam no Centenario do Nascimento 1880-1980*, ed. by José Machado Lourenço, Secretariado Braga nacional do Apostolado da Oração, Editorial A O, 1980, pp. 11 f.

won him admiration in Goa, where Tomás Ribeiro and Cunha Rivara were still remembered for those qualities. His pastoral visits to distant corners of the country made his influence felt in the subcontinent. Dr. George Moraes, a Goan and University professor in Bombay, but also notably an arch-conservative Catholic, paid homage to the Patriarch during the first anniversary of his death, praising his contribution in the form of (1) pastoral visits, (2) Conferences of St. Vincent of Paul (3) House for the old clergy (4) Diocesan synod (5) intellectual standard of the seminarians (6) holiness of the clergy (7) parish schools and teaching of music (8) conclusion of the minor seminary that was started by D. Teotónio Vieira de Castro (suspended for lack of money) (9) A professional school of the Salesians (10) Fresh life to the SFX missionaries of local origin (11) Refugee home for women (12) Home for Students in Panjim (13) Selection of best priests to serve in other dioceses. Concludes by saying:

"Truly, the Cardinal Costa Nunes was one of the greatest men Portugal sent to the East. He was at the head of the Archdiocese little over a decade. Cardinal Costa Nunes is dead, but he will not die in the memory of a people that he helped to grow into one of the most influential communities in modern India."¹⁹

The Indian government had been pressing Portugal since 1950 to end its colonial rule in India. The Portuguese authorities were unwilling to consider the matter, refusing also the pressure in the UN to submit the list of its colonies. The Portuguese changed the Constitution to designate colonies as "overseas provinces" as a diplomatic subterfuge. The Indian demands also included the end of the Portuguese Padroado rights in India as incompatible with India's sovereignty.

The performance of D. José da Costa Nunes has to be analysed against this background of Portugal-India relations. His intense interest in reviving the missionary activity in India needs to be viewed also against the political-nationalist background of the *Nyogi Report* (1954-56) which recommended a ban on the missionary activities as detrimental to the political loyalty of the Christians and to the religious and cultural sentiments of non-Christian populations of India.²⁰ The Nyogi Committee utilised as one of its source books the *Asia and Western Dominance* of K. M. Panikkar²¹, who had been an architect of independent India's foreign policy and had portrayed the European missionaries in Asia as colonial stooges seeking to dominate by infiltrating into Asian cultures.

The religious-political convictions of D. José da Costa Nunes had various challenges to face in the new political context of independent India. In 1948 the Holy See appointed a Goan, Valerian Gracias as archbishop of Bombay. It was in

19 O Heraldo, Panjim, 29-30 November, 1-2 December 1977.

20 The Christian response to the Report is contained in: A. Soares et al. (eds.): *Truth Shall Prevail*, Bombay 1957. The following web link may illustrate this point in the words of Mahatma Gandhi on 11 May 1935, as reported in Harijan <http://www.vigilonline.com/records/meetings/relart/relconversionpub.htm>.

21 K. M. Panikkar: *Asia and Western Dominance*, London: George Allen & Unwin, 1953. New edition was brought out by The Other Press at Kuala Lumpur in 1993 with a new preface by Claude Alvares/Teotónio R. de Souza.

violation of a Padroado accord of 1928, which provided for alternation of white Portuguese and British citizens as bishops of Bombay. India had raised objection to this clause as violation of India's sovereignty in 1947. Salazar understood well the political sensitivity of India and showed willingness to compromise and modify the accord, and it happened in 1950. Mgr. Gracias had no great sympathies for Portugal. After his consecration he was once greeted in Rome by some Portuguese, including a priest who reported the matter to the Portuguese authorities. Gracias seems to have replied curtly in English, saying that he was an India and had nothing to do with the Portuguese!²² A couple of years later Archbishop Gracias was candidate for cardinalate, and the nuncio in Portugal conveyed to the Vatican its negative reaction, suggesting that it would only accept the cardinalate for D. José da Costa Nunes who had felt slighted by Vatican's plans and moved out of Goa. Salazar regime threatened to withdraw his ambassador from the Holy See if his grievance was not respected. Vatican then proceeded to award a Golden Rose to the Archdiocese of Goa in recognition of its historic role, and decided to name D. José da Costa Nunes vice-camerlengo of the Vatican.²³

D. José da Costa Nunes utilised very well three major religious celebrations to counter the public opinion that was not too favourable to his defence of "Faith and Empire". Curiously, he seemed convinced that the Faith needed forever the "Portuguese" empire for its survival and progress. These three occasions were: (1) the canonization of St. John Britto in June 1947 (He was a Portuguese Jesuit who followed the indigenization method of De Nobili in Madurai in the 17th century and was killed), (2) the plenary council of the Church of India in 1950, where D. José da Costa Nunes presided over its inauguration as per the right granted to him by the Concordat of 1940 (3) the fourth centenary of the death of St. Francis Xavier (whose relics attract thousands of pilgrims to Goa) in December 1952. This happened to coincide with commemoration of the arrival of St. Thomas in India. This exposition of the relics of Francis Xavier in Goa was attended by representatives of the Portuguese government in Lisbon, as well as by the Cardinal patriarch of Lisbon, who came as Papal Legate. It would take much space to analyse the speeches and writings of D. José da Costa Nunes on these various occasions, but he did not miss any opportunities to hammer into his listeners his convictions as a representative of the Portuguese Padroado in the prevailing political context. Just a quote from the Archdiocesan Bulletin of July 1951 (Nº1) commemorating 25 years of Salazar coming to power:

"by his culture and clear vision of problems, he laid the foundations of the so-called New State [...] an eminent statesman who sees and foresees, builds and solidifies [...] gained a unique reputation as a person of character and right intentions [...] without Dr. Oliveira Salazar it is certain that the aims of the revolt of 28 May would end in failure."²⁴

22 Braga da Cruz: *O Estado Novo e a Igreja Católica*, p. 111.

23 *Ibid.*

24 D. José da Costa Nunes: *Magistério do Patriarca*, Macau: Fundação Macau, 1999, pp. 193 f.

D. José da Costa Nunes was given a reception at the Governor's palace in the capital city of Goa in September 1953. It was meant to commemorate the golden jubilee of his priestly ordination and his imminent departure as Patriarch of Goa. In his speech on the occasion, he referred to his religious patriotism, which did not exclude, but intensified civic patriotism. He affirmed that many had misinterpreted this and saw in it political motivations under the cover of religion. He saw it only as a way of glorifying the evangelizing deeds of the Portuguese Crown Patronage. He added:

"I have witnessed difficult moments, provoked by exalted nationalisms. Even when I tried to keep myself out and above such nationalisms, my thoughts were often disfigured. I do not have to change any of my words or attitudes, because I followed always the wise guiding rules of the Church. I did not engage myself in any political propaganda under cover of the Gospels, but neither did I hesitate to say what my duty demanded. In Goa, I recommended obedience to legitimate authorities, condemned anti-nationalist propaganda and upheld the respect for the flag which gave the Goan his special qualities. Outside Goa I advised the faithful to love their country, to collaborate with their authorities for the progress of India, which I regard as having a special role in this part of the world, a role which it will fulfil satisfactorily only at the feet of Christ. Will this happen long time from now? After another century? After many centuries? Let us not seek to penetrate the secrets of the Providence, but we can rest assured that in time, the Church will bring all peoples under the victorious banner of the Cross [...] When I say good-bye to Goa after 11 years, I say good bye to my missionary life in the East. It was sufficient time to create strong bonds to people of Goa. I leave them with deep agitation within me and I shall always carry fond memories with me, even though it has not been all flowers all along."

He reminded himself and those present of the sight across river Mandovi, when he was standing once in the verandah of the parish residence of Penha de França. It was a delightful and exciting sight which made him recall the past centuries since the arrival of the Portuguese. He felt proud of the past, but also sad. The empire had been mutilated over time and he was wondering if it would be subjected to fresh blows. He recalled what D. João Mascarenhas had told Kwaja Zafar during the second siege of Diu, when the Portuguese were asked to surrender, because their fort was already without walls. The reply he sent to Khwaja Zafar was: The Portuguese do not require walls to defend themselves. The Patriarch was now making those his own words: "The land where the Portuguese are will forever be Portuguese" (*Terra onde estão portugueses, portuguesa será sempre*).²⁵

But the same Patriarch was writing a piece of history of the Portuguese Crown Patronage in the East some decades earlier:

"Portugal is rightly viewed as a country of missionaries. Before the Discoveries and Conquests, the Gospel was limited almost exclusively to Europe. But ever since we forced open the East and planted *fortresses* along the coasts of Africa and Asia, the Christianity penetrated everywhere, calling peoples to share the Christian civilization, and this call was extended

25 Portugal em Africa X, Nº 60, November/December 1953, pp. 372-375.

both to colonized peoples and to those who remained free" (*os povos dominados e mesmo os que livres continuaram*).²⁶

After all the Patriarch had said the contrary, the Portuguese did require fortresses to protect themselves, and there were "dominated" people, and people who were "free". Obviously, in the changed anti-colonial ambience, the discourse of D. José da Costa Nunes had to be different. We can check if his other writings did not betray nationalism which he claims was never a part of his religious discourses and actions.

On his arrival and taking charge of Goa Archdiocese, the Patriarch changed the name of the Archdiocesan Bulletin from *Voz de S. Francisco Xavier* to *Boletim Eclesiástico da Arquidiocese de Goa*, and started publishing therein with regularity his "Letters to Priests of the Archdiocese". Sixty of these letters published between 1942 and 1946 were gathered into a book that was released in 1947 in Lisbon to mark his Episcopal Jubilee (1946).²⁷ In the very first letter he reminds his priests that a dedicated and conscientious subject takes the wish of his superior as an order, and he expresses his interest in making his ideas and wishes known to his clergy from time to time in letters that he intended to publish in the Archdiocesan Bulletin. Hence, some extracts from these letters, accompanied by our critical comments may provide the reader a glimpse into the style of functioning of the Patriarch Costa Nunes. He says it again in the same above quoted letter that he does not want to appear as a boss who imposes anything, but as a friend conversing with friends, or a father with his children. But the objective was clear: To be listened to and obeyed!²⁸

From the third letter onwards there are constant recommendations to the clergy to promote Catholic Action in order to prepare Christian elite to counter the threats of rationalism and communism to the established social order. Cites examples of the success of Catholic Action movement in various European countries. His forty-two letters addressed to the youth contain his more detailed vision for the youth.²⁹ In his letters to the priests he touches upon some issues that interest us in this context: Sees no place for caste system in the Catholic community. Points to cases of open protests of the oppressed castes in the subcontinent. Fears that protests from below may lead to breakdown of the Indian society, and recommends changes from above. Admits the reality and even the need of different levels of functioning of the "classes" in a society, but does not see place for caste in the modern times and does not want to see any trace of it in the functioning of his priests.³⁰ Regarding Indian nationalism and tendencies to curb the freedom of missionary preaching, sees them as contrary to freedom of conscience that is

26 José da Costa Nunes: *Padroado Português no Extremo-Oriente*, in: *Boletim da Agência Geral das Colónias*, November 1929, Nº 53, pp. 40-45.

27 D. José da Costa Nunes: *Cartas aos Sacerdotes da Arquidiocese de Goa*, Lisboa: Agência Geral das Colónias, 1947.

28 *Ibid.*, p. 7.

29 D. José da Costa Nunes: *Cartas aos Jovens Goeses*, Macau: Fundação Macau, 1999.

30 *Ibid.*, pp. 26-28.

guaranteed in a democracy. Questions the veracity of accusations levelled against the use of force by the Portuguese in converting people. Admits that there may have been stray cases, but that it was not a rule. Explains the "violence" as methods of a society moulded by Christian principles to allure pagans to church by favouring the converts in every possible way. Sees that as measures adopted to safeguard the freedom of cult against the social controls of the Hindus. The Patriarch laments that in more recent times the Portuguese authorities have failed to keep up the policy of the early colonizers. Imagines that if Portugal had 30-40 millions instead of 2-3 million inhabitants in the XVI-XVII centuries, the whole of India could be changed into a catholic nation without any violence, and it would be like Brazil. It would be a great power in Asia with its own culture and national unity. Compares British India with Portuguese India and concludes that despite some large and developed cities, British India is materially and culturally much more backward than Portuguese India. Goes further to state that whatever progress was made in British India was achieved with the assistance of Goan emigrants, whose contribution can be found in the scattered cities and ports of India. He attributes the capacity of Goan emigrants to their Christian upbringing, even in cases where this upbringing may be consciously rejected by some.³¹ In his 8th letter refers to the enthusiasm with which he was greeted by the Goan Catholic population in Bombay when he was returning after a pastoral visit to Daman, Nagar Haveli and Diu. He sensed that they were filled with love for Portugal and for the *Padroado*. Refers to nearly 50,000 Goans occupying posts in all walks of life and administration. Though belonging to third or fourth generation of emigrants, they were fond of Goa, fond of St. Francis Xavier and fond of the country that had brought Gospel to their ancestors. He had noticed the same feelings in Catholic emigrants all over Asia where he had been.³² Refers to the problem of beggary in Goa. He sees it as ubiquitous and suggests that random assistance would be of little help. Suggests that setting up Conferences of St. Vincent of Paul could help to remedy the problem with a well organized material assistance.³³ Elsewhere he focuses upon the urgency of organizing and coordinating at diocesan and metropolitan level the Catholic Action groups in all the parishes. Refers to stagnation in Goan Catholic life and prevalence of abuses of alcohol, contraception, prostitution among emigrant women and house maids, etc. Suggests better use of funds through Catholic Action movement, creation of parish libraries, instead of wasting the funds in music bands and fireworks during novenas and feasts.³⁴ Refers also to the ignorance among the clergy of the Indian culture and philosophy. Feels that they could care less for western philosophers and literatures, but ought to have mastered the Indian thought in order to pass on the Christian message to Indian minds.³⁵ States also that "among all our overseas possessions, Goa represents best

31 Ibid., pp. 35-41.

32 Ibid., pp. 43-53.

33 Ibid., pp. 71-74.

34 Ibid., pp. 81-85.

35 Ibid., pp. 87-91.

the colonizing spirit of the Portuguese. We made it a Christian land and a Portuguese land, without destroying its Indian characteristics". By making the Goan Portuguese, we did not uproot him from his culture. A Goan remains psychologically proud of his Indian cultural and historical greatness. A Goan is a link between India and Europe.³⁶ His constant refrain is the lack of missionary spirit among Goan priests, who have little to do in the parishes, while vast regions in India have no priests. Expresses his interest in helping the Goan Congregation of Pilar Fathers to launch out in mission work.³⁷ The letters contain frequent statements of dubious historical value. While rejecting the accusations that Goan converts were made to change names and dressing habits, states that they were the ones who willingly opted for those changes to distance themselves from the Hindu society that rejected them and to be closer to the Portuguese who helped them. Sees the accusations as expressions of exaggerated nationalism. Points out to other countries that adopt western style of dress as they get materially more developed and interact more with other countries. Is convinced that Europe will be the universal model for the educated generations all over the world. Takes up also the accusation of missionaries being foreign nationalists! *Does not see why a missionary should renounce his country, as long as he does not make political propaganda under cover or religion.*³⁸

Patriarch's silence about Goa's freedom struggle?

Tristão Bragança-Cunha, a Goan nationalist and freedom-fighter, was the first Goan deported to Portugal in 1946 for 8 years in jail.³⁹ It happened during the Church governance of D. José da Costa Nunes in Goa. The Brazilian sociologist Gilberto Freyre, who visited Goa at the behest of Salazar in 1951, only saw "lusotropicalism" which he was commissioned to see and had nothing to say in his published report *Aventura e Rotina* about Tristão Bragança-Cunha, who was jailed in Lisbon at the time he passed through Lisbon before visiting Goa. The Goan freedom fighter, however, did not forget to comment on the superficial knowledge of Gilberto Freyre about the Goan reality.⁴⁰ Tristão Bragança-Cunha also wrote in his newspaper "Free Goa" on 25 August-1956 about the already mentioned *Nyogi Report*, which recommend the ban on conversions to Christianity in India. T. B. Cunha fully endorsed the recommendation, because he too con-

36 Ibid., pp. 93-94.

37 Ibid., pp. 105-109.

38 Ibid., pp. 112-115.

39 He was recognized as the prime representative of Goa's freedom struggle and his ashes are preserved in a monument dedicated to those who died for Goa's freedom struggle in the capital city of Goa.

40 Teotonio R. de Souza: Gilberto Freyre in India: Championing Transnational Luso-Tropicalism, in: M. A. Nayeem/Anirudha Ray/K. S. Mathew (eds.): Studies in History of the Deccan: Medieval and Modern: Professor A. R. Kulkarni Felicitation Volume, New Delhi: Pragati Publishers, 2002, pp. 253-262.

sidered the European missionaries as mainly responsible for the "denationalization" of the Goans. T. B. Cunha makes reference to the visit of D. José Costa Nunes to Goa in the previous month and quotes a part of his "bellicose harangue":

"For us, Portuguese, this land of Goa is a precious treasure of remembrances and high values that gives so much splendour to the Portuguese nation. Here took place events which brightened our history; here were written pages that time cannot tarnish; here was planted the tree of Cross which spread its branches over the entire East; here lived heroes and saints who aggrandized our country and religion; Western culture which we brought to this half of the world, previously full of legends and mysteries, started from here; hosts of soldiers and missionaries came here to serve their king and God; and now in this glorious land of Goa new events are taking place that history will recall as examples of loyalty and patriotism, spiritual strength and love to common Motherland.

Why then wonder if we refuse to quit?

A soldier who sheds his blood for his national territory is worth more than a coffer full of gold or fine speeches which move audiences. Numbers do not count, but only the quality of each unit. In the past, with few we did great things [...].

Goa and other Eastern lands, where lives the race sung by our national poet, are in our days the greatest centres of culture and civilization of Asia. It is upon you, members of the Catholic Action, that lies the duty of preserving this centre of faith."

T. B. Cunha wonders about the partiality and double standards of the Vatican which was quick to admonish the Cardinal of Bombay for some mild words in favour of Goa's political liberation, but had nothing to say about the provocative words of the former Patriarch of Goa, D. José da Costa Nunes.⁴¹

The clearest political utterance of D. José da Costa Nunes on the issue of Goa's liberation occurs in his letters to the priests in 1946, stating forcefully that he will never abdicate as a Portuguese citizen his right to defend his country against historical calumnies. He further states in the same context:

"As a matter of principles, while Goa is a Portuguese territory, I can and should teach its inhabitants to love Portugal and condemn the cheap ideas (*veleidades*) of integrating it in Greater India. The Gospel commands obedience to legitimate authorities and Rome does not permit that any missionary indulges in anti-national propaganda within the boundaries of the Portuguese Colonial Empire. I do not do anything wrong, therefore, in recommending submission and respect to the Portuguese authorities [...] while this is Portuguese, I have the right to defend the National Flag and to condemn any disturbances against the Country."⁴²

In two earlier letter the Patriarch called upon the priests to love Portugal and warned them:

"You owe all to Portugal; you owe your religion which made Goa the most advanced region of India. If Portugal ceases to be in India, it would be the greatest disaster for the Goan

41 Tristão Bragança-Cunha: Anti-Indian activities of Catholic Missionaries, in: Goa's Freedom Struggle: Selected Writings of T. B. Cunha, Bombay: Dr. T. B. Cunha Memorial Committee, 1961, pp. 493-497.

42 Da Costa Nunes: Cartas aos Sacerdotes, p. 279 f.

Catholics. Under Portuguese rule, they are something, they have everything in their land; without Portugal their fate will be sad indeed."⁴³

Epilogue

In 1958, the Portuguese dictator, Dr. António de Oliveira Salazar was being defied in his choice of a President for Portugal in elections that since his coming to power in 1926 were meant to confirm his fancies. General Humberto Dalgado was not his choice for the Presidency, but he had become a voice of the suppressed political opposition and had rightly earned for himself the popular nickname of "Fearless General". However, while dissociating himself publicly from this opposition candidate, D. Antonio Ferreira Gomes, the Bishop of Oporto, had sent in July 1958 a "pró-memória" or an aide-memoire to the Portuguese dictator, asking for an interview in which he wished to bring to the notice of the dictator his pastoral concern about the political pressures upon the Church preaching and the political violations of the right of workers to protest against the State sponsored "corporativism". The bishop wished to know if the Church was free to teach its social doctrine and if the faithful had the right to make their own political options and to participate freely in the forthcoming elections. The bishop was quickly rebuked and arrangements were made through Cardinal D. José Costa Nunes, who was serving at the time at the Vatican, to send the bishop for "holidays" to Rome. It would be a 10-year long exile for the vocal bishop. Apparently, D. José da Costa Nunes, mentioned to a researcher later that he was "misled by Salazar into believing that it was only for a very short period of time"⁴⁴. The exile of the bishop of Oporto had a far reaching impact and provoked many Catholics that opposed the regime to come out more openly with their protests. The Catholic Action which the Patriarch had worked so hard to introduce and promote in Goa had now become the prime target of Salazar's protests before the Vatican. He saw the Catholic Action being transformed into undeclared political parties in violation of his Constitution.⁴⁵ Encyclicals of Pope John XXIII and Vatican II came to provide doctrinal support for their demands and to fan more active political dissidence, which, jointly with the discontent of the young recruits being sent to fight the colonial rebellions in Africa, contributed to the downfall of the dictatorial regime in 1974.

D. José da Costa Nunes lived long enough to see many of his life-long convictions collapse. He may have realized that it is not easy to practise the Gospel on the issue of giving to Caesar what belongs to Caesar and to God what belongs to God. Curiously, he may have had foreseen this difficulty when he referred to this passage of the Gospel of Mark 12:17 while ending his very first pastoral letter he issued as Bishop of Macau.⁴⁶

⁴³ *Ibid.*, pp. 115, 143.

⁴⁴ *Dicionário de História Religiosa de Portugal*, IV, ed. by Carlos Moreira Azevedo, Lisboa: Circulo de Leitores, 2000, p. 409; António Marujo: Quando o bispo do Porto se demarcou da oposição, in: *Público*, Lisboa, 22 April 1999.

⁴⁵ Braga da Cruz: *O Estado Novo e a Igreja Católica*, pp. 69-77.

⁴⁶ *Cardeal Costa Nunes: Pastorais*, Macau: Fundação Macau, 1999, p. 33.

Das Verhältnis christlicher Missionare und Missionsgesellschaften gegenüber den politischen Machthabern und Bewegungen im 19. und 20. Jahrhundert steht im Mittelpunkt des Sammelbandes. Die Beiträge analysieren sowohl die wechselseitigen Beziehungen der Leitungen von Missionsgesellschaften zu den jeweiligen Regierungen in Europa als auch das Verhältnis ihrer Missionare – Männer und Frauen – auf den Arbeitsfeldern in Asien und Afrika zu den lokal bzw. regional maßgeblichen politischen Kräften (Kolonialmächte eigener oder fremder Nationalität, souveräne Staaten, lokale politische Systeme und Unabhängigkeitsbewegungen) in den einzelnen Facetten.

www.steiner-verlag.de

Franz Steiner Verlag

ISBN 3-515-08423-1



9 783515 084239